



TOWN OF WAYNESVILLE

Historic Preservation Commission

9 South Main Street
Waynesville, NC 28786
Phone (828) 456-8647 • Fax (828) 452-1492
www.waynesvillenc.gov

Development Services
Director
Elizabeth Teague

Chairman
Sandra Owen (Chairman)
Board Members
Alex McKay (Vice)
Ann Melton
Coley Bartholomew
Bette Sprecher
Glenn Duerr
Jeff Childers
Virgil Messer
Bill Revis

REGULAR MEETING

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

TOWN OF WAYNESVILLE MUNICIPAL BUILDING

16 SOUTH MAIN STREET

June 6, 2018

Members Present:

Sandra Owen - Chairman
Alex McKay - Vice Chairman
Coley Bartholomew
Jeff Childers
Ann Melton
Virgil Messer
Bill Revis
Bette Sprecher

Absent:

Glenn Duerr

Also Present:

Elizabeth Teague, Development Services Director
Byron Hickox, Land Use Administrator

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. Welcome and Announcements

Chairman Sandra Owen called the meeting to order at 2:00 PM.

2. Adoption of Minutes of May 2, 2018

A motion was made by Commission Member Ann Melton, seconded by Commission Member Bette Sprecher, to adopt the minutes of the May 2, 2018 meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

Historic Preservation Commission Minutes
June 18, 2018

B. BUSINESS ITEMS

1. Quasi- Judicial Consideration of an Application for a Certificate for Appropriateness for the Demolition or Removal of the First Presbyterian Church Manse located at 39 Walnut Street

Chairman Sandra Owen read an introduction to the hearing and swore in Land Use Administrator Byron Hickox, Development Services Director Elizabeth Teague, and various attending Church members. Chairman Sandra Owen directed staff to present evidence.

Mr. Hickox asked the Historic Preservation Committee Members to look at the staff report. He advised this is a public hearing to consider a Certificate of Appropriateness, at the location of 39 Walnut Street. The building is within the Spread Out Historic District and the zoning is Central Business District. This is the proposed demolition or removal of the manse, also known as a parsonage. The First Presbyterian Church manse is listed as a contributing building to the Spread Out Historic District, a National Register Historic District that was established in 2010. The National Register documentation contains the following passage regarding the First Presbyterian Church manse:

Located to the north of the Presbyterian church, the two-story Colonial Revival-style manse features a gambrel roof with a flared, broken pitch in the lower roof slope, engaged partial-width porch, shed dormers, stuccoed interior chimney, and replacement one-over-one windows. The house has been covered with aluminum siding. The single- leaf glazed-and-paneled entry door is flanked by multi-light sidelights. The congregation rebuilt the manse in 1930, borrowing \$4,000.00 for its construction.

Representatives of the First Presbyterian Church have approached town staff about the possibility of demolishing or removing the manse. According to the church's Building and Grounds Committee, the manse is in an advanced state of disrepair and would be prohibitively expensive for the church to repair and bring into compliance with current building codes.

Mr. Hickox read the Town's Land Development Standards and his staff report and explained the purpose of the staff recommendation.

As noted in the attachments from the First Presbyterian Church, the issue of the proper course of action regarding the First Presbyterian Church manse has been considered by the church for many years. Various solutions have been explored, including complete rehabilitation, demolition, removal, and inaction on the issue. It appears that the church and the Building and Grounds Committee have made a good faith effort to find the best solution for the situation at hand. The proposal by the church to demolish or remove the manse does not appear to be a decision made in haste or without proper consideration. It seems unlikely that a delay in the demolition, or removal of the building, would create an additional more desirable outcome. The building and its foundation will only continue to degrade and become less stable.

Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish or remove the First Presbyterian Church manse located at 39 Walnut Street (PIN 8615-38-9417).

Chairman Sandra Owen asked the applicant to come forward and speak:

Ron Morrow
First Presbyterian Church Building and Grounds Chair
Waynesville, NC 28786

Mr. Morrow said there are limited options due to the deteriorated condition of the manse. He said there is evidence of foundation failure, leaks, water damage, cast iron piping, heating and air conditioning system inadequacy, interior repairs, and repairs for porches, ceilings, and siding. He told the board it has been ten years since anyone has occupied the building and stated parking options are limited with the position of the manse's location. Mr. Morrow alluded to a report from 02/28/12 which listed options the church had in reference to the manse:

- Do nothing
- Sell the manse
- Fix up the manse to sell or rent
- Rent the manse to fix up
- Pay to demolish
- Fire Department burn the manse

Mr. Morrow advised that the estimated totals from the 2012 report were \$157,500.00.

The church investigated selling the property and consulted with a realtor, who advised the manse property would have to be subdivided. The option to invest this type of money to repair the property or rent the manse was not feasible. Demolition estimates were received from four different companies for approximately \$49,000.00. This did not include asbestos abatement, oil tank and utility type work. Mr. Morrow advised the church then spoke with the Fire Chief about burning the manse and that was going to be the most cost effective. He said he had gone through two years of minutes and the issue of the manse had been brought up ten more times. They were continually trying to address the issue and come up with something better but there were no better answers provided. He advised he was open to questions from the Commission.

Commission Member Bill Revis asked about the after plan and added that he is not in favor of demolishing the building for an asphalt parking lot.

Mr. Morrow replied that although they don't currently have plans, there is some desire to have easier handicap access, such as a circle drive, but there is a lack of funds.

Land Use Administrator, Mr. Hickox, reminded the Board that at this time the only consideration is the Certificate of Appropriateness application to demolish or remove, with no contingencies on or what may or may not happen during the future. This application is just to consider the demolition or removal of the building.

Commission Members asked Mr. Morrow various questions regarding the financial estimates provided, how the manse got into its current condition, if the church would consider having it surveyed, or selling, or renting it. They also asked if there was asbestos in the manse. Mr. Morrow advised that he knew nothing more of estimates other than what he had provided. He was not there in earlier years to have knowledge of the severe deterioration other than he understood it to be from a leak and it had been unoccupied for over ten years now. He said that the church's main objective was to try to hold onto the real estate and not sell. Mr. Morrow also advised that there is asbestos, and the last estimate provided was \$2000.00 for abatement. He added that even if the fire department did a burn, there would need to be an abatement of the asbestos first. He said that he knew of no other contamination.

The Commission asked Mr. Morrow for clarification that the application was for demolition or removal of the manse, and if selling it was excluded as an option. Mr. Morrow replied as far as Session was concerned, they will not sell it and they will not remodel it.

The Commission asked if the church had considered moving the house to a vacant lot. Mr. Morrow advised the church was not in the business of moving houses. The Commission asked if someone wanted the house would you just give it to them. Mr. Morrow advised he could only speak for himself in that he would say just take it. There was also discussion about the 2012 report and the numbers that were being presented to the commission.

Chairman Sandra Owen asked Mr. Morrow if they would consider aggressively trying to advertise the removal of the house. Mr. Morrow advised he could not speak for Session but he could recommend it to them.

Members of the public stood to request to speak. Chairman Sandra Owen swore them in.

Ron Tingle
95 Meadowlark Lane
Waynesville, NC 28786

Mr. Ron Tingle is Clerk of the Session. Mr. Tingle defined Session as the Board of the Directors for the Presbyterian Church. He advised the manse property is a treasure to the church for the real estate and that they do not have the \$157,000 dollars to make the house on it habitable. The congregation and Session do not want to sell the property. He informed the Historic Commission that they have looked for buyers and individuals who would move the house, and would commit to moving the manse before demolition.

Austin Lee
53 Walnut St
Waynesville, NC 28786

Mr. Austin Lee advised he lives next door and moving the manse would be difficult. It is a big house to move through the neighborhood corners. He has been in the house, inspected it, and believes the renovation estimates presented are accurate. The foundation is deteriorating. Selling the house is going to be a very expensive renovation.

Mr. Tingle asked to speak again and advised that the driveway to the manse is also the rear drive to the church, and he did not want their church to just give that up. Commission Member Ann Melton asked why not if they have it surveyed out so just the drive is remaining with part of the church.

Commission Member Alex McKay commented that if the church were his he wouldn't sell the property either because he believes you don't sell what you own next to you. He asked Development Services Director Elizabeth Teague if there were plans the church may have in the future pertaining to the lot would they have to be presented before the Commission.

Ms. Teague advised that the Historic District would have to approve the construction. Ms. Teague said even if it were just a parking lot, it would still have to conform to town ordinances for design guidelines and land development standards.

Chairman Sandra Owens swore in members of the public for public comment.

**Stanley Briggs
171 Minnetonka Rd
Waynesville, NC 28785**

Mr. Briggs informed he is an eight year member of the church and his wife, Pat, is on the Session. He said that if they were to lose the parking it would be devastating to their congregation. He told the Commission that there is no place to park, and that is one of the reasons why this land was important to them.

**Bo Prevost
Box 164, 28 Lodge Lane
Waynesville, NC 28786**

Ms. Prevost advised that she wanted to address one concern about the state of the manse. Their main concern was saving the church. She wanted the Commission to understand what a big step and leap of faith it would be to absorb that expense. This request is not just for the church, but for the betterment of the community. Ms. Prevost spoke of how the building has served its purpose and the time for it to go has arrived. Our church has worked hard, and the congregation has worked together to save this church.

**Lee Galloway
150 Azalea Dr
Waynesville, NC 28786**

Mr. Galloway addressed the Commission and said that Mr. Ted Alexander with NC Preserve had been contacted to look at the house. Mr. Galloway advised the Board that they have investigated the possibility of moving the structure. He also addressed a concern that there is not enough setbacks with the driveway being so close to the house, and that parceling off a drive for the church would go against zoning ordinances in the town.

Development Services Director Elizabeth Teague advised without a submitted drawing the town would not be able to determine compliances.

Commission Member Virgil Messer made a motion, seconded by Commission Member Bill Revis to continue the hearing until Wednesday, June 20th 2018 at 2:00 pm in the Town Hall Board Room located at 9 South Main Street, Waynesville. The motion passed with five ayes- (Chairman Sandra Owen, Jeff Childers, Bette Sprecher); and three nays- (Vice Chairman Alex McKay, Coley Bartholomew, Ann Melton).

2. Historic Coloring Book Report

Mr. Hickox gave an update to the Commission on the Historic coloring book. He advised the Mountaineer did a front-page newspaper article on the presentation to the local schools. The students and teachers were thankful. Chairman Sandra Owen reiterated how we needed to thank Glenn, and

Chris Sylvester for the fantastic artwork, Alex McKay for writing all the historical notes, and to Byron for shepherding this project. The total cost for 500 copies with the glossy cover was \$904.15.

3. Schedule July HPC Meeting

The consensus of the Commission was to cancel the July regular meeting because of the July 4th holiday. The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held on Wednesday, August 1st, 2018.

D. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Coley Bartholomew and seconded by Bette Sprecher to adjourn the meeting at 4:10 P.M. All ayes. The motion carried unanimously.

The Continued Quasi-Judicial Hearing date is Wed, June 20th at 2:00 P.M.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Wed, August 1st at 2:00 P.M.



Sandra Owen, Chairman

Aug. 1, 2018



Chelle Baker, Administrative Assistant

*Transcribed by/Absent due to a class